

CEEDAR Conference
September 29, 2017

*Putting Research-to-Practice in Teacher Preparation:
Learner Ready Day One*

A Practical Approach to Teaching Argumentation

Cheryl C. Dickinson
Professor Emeritus, Literacy
Southern Connecticut State University

cheryl.cullen.dickinson@gmail.com

Argument Element:

Writing Standard		
Knowledge/Concepts <i>What does the student need to know? List nouns and important adjectives.</i>		
<p style="text-align: center;">Skills</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><i>What should the student be able to do?</i></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><i>List verbs</i></p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Levels</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Bloom's Taxonomy</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li style="margin-bottom: 10px;"><input type="checkbox"/> Remember/ Understand <li style="margin-bottom: 10px;"><input type="checkbox"/> Apply <li style="margin-bottom: 10px;"><input type="checkbox"/> Analyze <li style="margin-bottom: 10px;"><input type="checkbox"/> Evaluate/ Create 	<p style="text-align: center;">Levels</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Webb's Levels</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li style="margin-bottom: 10px;"><input type="checkbox"/> Recall <li style="margin-bottom: 10px;"><input type="checkbox"/> Skills/ Concept <li style="margin-bottom: 10px;"><input type="checkbox"/> Strategic Thinking <li style="margin-bottom: 10px;"><input type="checkbox"/> Extended Thinking
Student Friendly Objectives/Teaching Points <i>What series of lessons or work up to the level of rigor of the standard?</i>		
Formative Assessment <i>What sequence of assessments match the rigor in each task above?</i>		
Evidence of Student Mastery		

Unpacking The Elements of Argument

A Sequence of Lessons

Gr. 6 *Writing Standards #1, 2b, and 8 are unpacked to assist planning.*

Element	CCSS	Lesson Topics
Evidence	1a, b, c	1b - using accurate, credible sources 1b - using relevant evidence 1a - organize reasons and evidence logically 1c - clarify the relationships among reasons and evidence
Warrant	1b, 1c	1b - support claims with logical reasoning, demonstrating an understanding of the topic or text. 1c - clarify the relationships among reasons and evidence
Claim	1a, b, c, e	1a - introduce claim(s) 1b - support claims with logical reasoning using accurate, credible sources and relevant evidence 1a - acknowledge alternate or opposing claims and organize the reasons and evidence logically 1c - clarify the relationships among claim(s), [including] reasons, and evidence 1c - use words, phrases, and clauses to create cohesion [among] relationships ... claim(s), reasons, and evidence 1e provide concluding statement or section that follows from the argument presented
Backing	1b, 2b	1b - support claims with logical reasoning 2b - develop topic with relevant facts, concrete details 2b - develop topic with definitions, examples, other information 2b - develop topic with quotations
Counter-claim	1a, e 8	1a - acknowledge alternate or opposing claims, and organize the reasons and evidence logically 1e - provide concluding statement or section that follows from the argument presented 8 - gather relevant information from multiple print and digital sources 8 - assess the credibility of each source 8 - quote or paraphrase the data and conclusions of others while avoiding plagiarism 8 - provide basic bibliographic information for sources

Unpacking the Elements of Argument

Matching ELA Writing Standards with Argument Elements

While most ELA CCSS can address aspects of writing and defending arguments, writing standards 1, 2b, and 8 correspond closely with the five argument elements and are good starting points. To go deeper into argumentation, consult the Literacy Design Collaborative modules.

Basic Writing Standards CCSS Writing Standards, gr. 6

1. Write arguments to support claims with clear reasons and relevant evidence.
 - a. Introduce claim(s), acknowledge alternate or opposing claims, and organize the reasons and evidence logically
 - b. Support claims with logical reasoning, using accurate, credible sources and relevant evidence, using accurate credible sources and demonstrating an understanding of the topic or text.
 - c. Use words, phrases, and clauses to create cohesion and clarify the relationships among claim(s), reasons, and evidence.
 - d. Establish and maintain a formal style. (throughout)
 - e. Provide a concluding statement or section that follows from the argument presented.

- 2b. Develop the topic with relevant facts, definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples.

8. Gather relevant information from multiple print and digital sources; assess the credibility of each source; and quote or paraphrase the data and conclusion of others while avoiding plagiarism and providing basic bibliographic information for sources.

Note: About reading standards -

Reading standards 1, 8 and others spell out what skills are assumed within some writing standards. Rereading the reading standards may help to unwrap writing standards even further!

Planning Instruction

LDC Resources

1.LDC Task Templates Argumentation stems that shape according to any content:

- A4-Analysis
- A5-Compare
- A6-Cause-Effect
- A9-Evaluation
- A10-Problem Solution

2. LDC Mini Task lessons

3. Rubrics

Matching Activities with Phases of Learning

Surface	Deep	Transfer
<i>developing knowledge base of content and skills</i>	<i>assimilating, actively linking concepts and information</i>	<i>constructing, transferring skills, concepts from one text, discipline to another</i>
annotation	determining credibility	problem solving
organizing notes	concept maps showing relationships	Socratic seminars
summarizing	chunking text and writing questions	analogies, metaphors
inferring main ideas	determining relevance of information	LDC argument prompts
sequencing	reciprocal teaching	multi-modal tasks applying skills, concepts

Resources

Explicit Instruction

Fisher, D. & Frey, N. (2013). *Better learning through structured teaching: A framework for the gradual release of responsibility*, 2nd ed. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.

Visible Learning

Fisher, D., Frey, N. & Hattie, J. (2016). *Visible learning for literacy*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin.

Argumentation

Hillocks, G. (2011). *Teaching argument writing, grades 6-12*. Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann.

Lesson planning, assessment

Literacy Design Collaborative. (2014). LDC Task Template Collection 3.0

Retrieved 8/1/17

<https://coretools ldc.org/home>

To retrieve Task Templates, you must first join (free), log in, and then link to "resources" which provides links to the task templates, rubrics, student work samples, and more. Mini-gtasks (lessons) accessed from the LDC library. Incredible resource for argumentation!

Toulmin Model

Toulmin, S. (1969). *The uses of argument*. Cambridge University Press. Cambridge.